



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES  
2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
CITY HALL BUILDING, TWO CIVIC CENTER PLAZA  
MAY 21, 2012  
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, City Hall Building, May 21, 2012, 4:00 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present:

Commissioner Stephanie Fernandez

Commissioner Joel Guzman

Commissioner Randy Brock

Commissioner David Berchermann, Interim Chair

Commissioner Cesar Gomez

The following city staff were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Planning, Historic Preservation Officer

Ms. Kristen Hamilton, City Attorney's Office, Assistant City Attorney

**INTERIM CHAIR**

Neither Chair Booher nor Vice-Chair Gonzalez was present. Commissioner David Berchermann volunteered to be Chair for the meeting.

Meeting called to order at 4:13 p.m.

**I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT**

*None*



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



## **CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

Ms. Velázquez noted there were no changes to the agenda, therefore, the meeting would proceed as prescribed.

## **II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION**

### **Certificate of Appropriateness**

- 1. PHAP12-00010:** Block 2 of Radford Terrace, Lot 14 (8959.05), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 4632 King Arthur Court
- Historic District: Austin Terrace
- Property Owner: Thomas and Martha Cavazos
- Representative: Miguel Marquez
- Representative District: 2
- Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1996
- Historic Status: Non-Contributing
- Request: Certificate of appropriateness for the enclosure of a carport and the installation of a window and doors.
- Application Filed: 05/14/12
- 45 Day Expiration: 06/28/12

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant seeks approval for the enclosure of a carport and the installation of a window and door. The property is located at the end of the cul-de-sac. The property owner is proposing enclose the carport area and convert that area into an addition. The new addition area will then be used to expand the kitchen and



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

#### **Mayor**

John F. Cook

#### **City Council**

##### *District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

##### *District 2*

Susie Byrd

##### *District 3*

Emma Acosta

##### *District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

##### *District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

##### *District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

##### *District 7*

Steve Ortega

##### *District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

#### **City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



dining area. Ms. Velázquez noted the proposed stucco will match the existing original structure.

Ms. Velázquez stated the Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL, *with modifications*\*\* of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic District Design Guidelines* recommend the following:

- *Additions should complement the original structure but not necessarily attempt to duplicate or copy it.*
- *The older structure should be identifiable from the new addition.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommend the following:

- *The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion.*

*\*\* The modification is that the wall of the new addition on the main façade be constructed one (1) foot behind the existing posts instead of being flush with the support columns.*

Interim Chair Berchermann asked if commissioners had any questions and/or comments for staff or the property owner. There being none.

Interim Chair Berchermann asked there was any discussion amongst the commissioners.

Commissioner Fernandez asked staff if the property was non-contributing.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027



**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Brock, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS PHAP12-00010.*

**AMENDED MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Brock, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS PHAP12-00010 WITH THE MODIFICATION AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF.*

2. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. May 21, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the June 11, 2012 meeting. June 11, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the June 25, 2012 meeting.

**A. A. B. Fall Mansion at 1725 Arizona Avenue**

Ms. Velázquez explained there is still some on-going construction; construction should be completed early May sometime. The graffiti has not been removed or painted over; the plan is to paint over the graffiti



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



prior to construction completion. As far as she knew, Ms. Velázquez stated, the City has found a potential tenant.

**B. El Paso High School**

As stated at the May 7, 2012 meeting, Ms. Velázquez would like commissioners to remove the item from the agenda due to lack of progress. She explained the property has never been formally designated a Historic Landmark by the City of El Paso. EPISD has always treated it as though it were a landmark by coming to the City asking for our opinion. To get the property designated would cost an estimated \$30,000.00 and she explained the rezoning process and all that it entails. Historic Preservation staff has done a great deal of research on the property; however, staff has had no luck locating any type of formal agreement (w/EPISD). Currently, the property is not locally designated a Historic Landmark; however, it is listed on the National Register.

**RECOGNITION – CESAR GOMEZ, NEW COMMISSIONER**

At this time, Interim Chair Berchermann recognized newly appointed Historic Landmark Commissioner Cesar Gomez.

Commissioner Gomez thanked everyone and stated he is looking forward to working with everyone.

**HLC Staff Report**

3. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.  
(See Attachment "A")

***MOTION:***



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND  
UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.*

*Motion passed. (5-0)*

**Planning & Economic Development Department Reports**

4. None.

**Visionaries in Preservation Report**

5. None.

**Other Business**

6. A. Discussion on the Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines.

Ms. Velázquez explained staff is continuing to work on them; she hoped to get them to commissioners soon. She explained that the Downtown Management District (DMD) board members have reviewed them and we are trying to come to some kind of compromise. The DMD does not want to change the point where both contributing and non-contributing properties to have to abide by the guidelines; however, commissioners do.

**OTHER HISTORIC DISTRICT GUIDELINES**

Ms. Velázquez stated she would be emailing some Historic District Design Guidelines to commissioners this week. She asked that commissioners review and make comments and return those guidelines to her as soon as you possibly can. Ms. Velázquez suggested staff and commissioners could review those guidelines, with your additional comments, at a future HLC meeting.



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



- B. Discussion and action regarding contributing versus non-contributing properties in the Downtown Historic District.

*Please see item 6.B.*

- C. Discussion and action placing an H-Overlay on the property located at 800 East Schuster Drive, El Paso High School.

Commissioner Guzman was not opposed to removing the item from agenda. He explained that Ms. Velázquez has received numerous phone calls from the media regarding this. Should there be any new information staff would place the item on the agenda.

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO DELETE THE ITEM FROM THE OTHER BUSINESS PORTION OF THE AGENDA.*

*Motion carried. (5-0)*

**PRIOR TO ADJOURNING**

1. Regarding agenda item 1. PHAP12-00010, Commissioner Guzman explained that he had driven through the neighborhood. However, he noticed that the homes in that subdivision do not add to the historic character that is Austin Terrace. Commissioner Guzman wondered why these homes were included in the historic district in the first place.

Ms. Velázquez agreed and noted these new homes have more of a suburban feel rather than the very distinct historic feel of Austin Terrace. She commented on the current definition of non-contributing and

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027



contributing and what that definition might be in twenty years. She was unsure what the process would be to change the map.

Commissioner Guzman wondered if commissioners wanted to discuss the matter further.

2. Memorandum

Interim Chair Berchermann asked staff if there was new information regarding amending the ordinance language.

Ms. Velázquez explained that goes hand in hand with the guidelines. Staff is exploring that as well, trying to decide what the best approach is/how to incorporate those changes. Staff is continuing to do behind the scenes research.

**ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS**

Commissioner Guzman wondered if it were possible for commissioners to explore the historic districts, as a group, and discuss the highlights of each district.

Ms. Velázquez explained staff and commissioners would have to coordinate a time/date when everyone could get together. Staff would have to post a meeting; there would have to be public access. Staff would look into it.

Interim Chair Berchermann suggested staff post an item regarding on the next HLC agenda.

***MOTION:***



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



*Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community*

**S E R V I C E   S O L U T I O N S   S U C C E S S**



*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock and*  
**UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE HISTORIC LANDMARK**  
**COMMISSION MEETING AT 4:31 P.M.**

*Motion passed. (5-0)*

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027